

STAFF REPORT

DATE May 19, 2015
PLACE 50 W Gay St
TIME 3:00 pm

A CALL TO ORDER

B APPROVAL OF MINUTES

~3:00 Meeting Summary- April 21, 2015

C OLD BUSINESS – Applications for CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL – TABLED CASES

~3:05 15-04-001 Address: 201 S. Lucas
Property Owner: Manhattan Project, LLC
Applicant: Jonathan Barnes Architecture and Design
To be reviewed: Live/work, multi-family development

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.19 Uses
3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

The applicant is proposing a two phase development, to include two (2) sixty-nine unit live/work apartment buildings and the reconstruction of Lucas Street. All units within the development are proposed to be studios. Lucas Lofts phase I will include 18 garage parking spaces on the ground floor, and the reconstruction of Lucas Street will include 70 parking spaces. The 88 new parking spaces will be accessory to Lucas Lofts phase I and existing uses within 401 W. Town and 400 W. Rich as a larger mixed use development.

The mixed use development of 401 W Town, 400 W Rich and Lucas Lofts phase I will have 138 parking spaces in total (88 new spaces added to 50 existing spaces). Staff supports the combined parking reduction for the development as it is consistent with Council Variance 12-036. Any future change-in-use or new development, including Lucas Lofts phase II, will be required to provide or request a variance for parking above the current proposed 138 spaces. Approved parking is associated with use; therefore if a change-in-use is proposed within the existing development additional parking may be required.

In February 2015, the applicant received EFRB approval for the phase I building elevations with the condition to return to the Board with a site plan, landscape plan, commitment to parking, and updated south elevation. The current application includes an updated site plan with landscaping, revised parking calculations, a south elevation study and a revised floor plan showing a reduction in the width of Market Alley by one (1) foot. Lighting and graphics are not included in this review.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
4 or more dwelling unit building	Permitted Use	Consistent
Live/work space	Permitted Use	Consistent
Artist work or sales space	Permitted Use	Consistent "Market Alley"

Surface Parking	Accessory Use	Consistent. Board approval of surface parking on separate parcel as an accessory use of Lucas Lofts phase I and existing uses in 401 W. Town and 400 W. Rich required.
Structured parking	Permitted Use	Garages on ground floor

Applicable Code Development Standards:

Standard	Art and Innovation District	Staff Comments
Minimum Front Yard	0'	Consistent
Maximum Front Yard	10'	
Minimum Parking Setback	5'	Consistent
Minimum Side Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Fence/Wall Setback	0'	Consistent - no fence provided
Minimum Rear Yard	0'	Consistent
Minimum Building Frontage	60%	Consistent
Maximum Bldg Height	5 stories or 60'	Consistent
Building Frontage	All Buildings shall front on Public street	Consistent
Lighting	3323.21	To be determined
Graphics	3323.21	To be determined
Parking, stacking, circulation	Not permitted between the principle building and right-of-way	Consistent
Parking Mixed use development: Lucas Lofts phase I 401 W Town 400 W Rich	Required: 270 Bicycle parking- 7 spaces Market Alley – not calculated Time and use of market alley uncertain	138 total spaces Bicycle parking – 14 spaces phase I Market Alley – 0 spaces

Applicable Plan Land Use Recommendation:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Neighborhood Mixed Use	16-45 du/acre	69 du/0.42 acres = 164 du/acre Staff is supportive of density as project is consistent with overall goals of EFCCD plan.

Applicable Plan Development Standards:

Recommendation	Standard	Staff Comments
Land Use Compatibility		Consistent with the code
Architecture— Mixed-Use, Commercial, Multifamily and institutional buildings	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture should be provided that establishes and defines a building's appeal and enhances the industrial character of East Franklinton. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New construction should be integrated with the existing fabric and scale of development in surrounding neighborhoods. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> A wide range of architectural styles are appropriate for East Franklinton, with preference for contemporary building design and materials. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All sides of a building should be coherently designed and treated. A consistent level of detailing and finish should be provided for all sides of a building ("foursided" architecture). 	Consistent

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Building frontages that exceed 50 feet in width should consider using vertical piers or other vertical elements, spaced at intervals of 15 feet to 30 feet along the entire building elevation. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New buildings should be consistent in mass and scale to recommendations in the East Franklinton plan. Larger buildings should be divided into smaller modules or bays. Floor-to-floor heights should appear to be similar to those in nearby traditional buildings, especially first floor windows. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street-level facades are recommended to be as transparent as possible to create an attractive pedestrian environment, except for residential spaces on ground floors. For a primary façade, at least 60 percent of the first-floor wall area (between two feet and ten feet) should be clear/non-tinted window glass, which permits a view of the building's interior to a minimum depth of four feet. At least 25 percent of upper-floor wall areas should be clear/non-tinted window glass. 	Additional windows on south elevation provided for Board consideration
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings with ground-floor residential spaces should have direct access to the public sidewalk and incorporate front stoops or small plazas to contribute to street activity. Multi-story buildings with residential units should incorporate balconies for the same reason. 	Front stoop/small plaza not provided
Accessibility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Promote accessibility and "visibility" in all new construction and rehabilitation of existing buildings 	Consistent
Parking	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Surface parking should be located to the rear or side of street-oriented buildings, with preference for the rear of buildings and screened per code. The use of pervious surfaces for surface parking is encouraged to minimize storm water runoff and increase infiltration. 	Surface parking to be located on Lucas Street (vacated by City). 90° parking Brick, asphalt, concrete, reclaimed curbing slabs, and reclaimed concrete used to break up street surface.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for parking lots is five feet; parking located adjacent to a public sidewalk, however, can be located closer than five feet, provided that it fully meets all screening requirements. Parking lots and accessory buildings should be located at the rear of the principal building. Where access to the rear of the property is not possible from a public alley or street, up to 50 percent of the parking may be located at the side of the principal building 	Parking lot is not screened. Headlight screening for ground level units may be appropriate. No screening on Town and Rich streets is appropriate due to urban character of neighborhood.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Structured parking should be considered for higher density projects, as appropriate, and designed to minimize visual impacts. Building materials, detailing and landscape should be used that complement the surrounding area. Primary elevations should include ground floor uses (e.g., commercial space) or be screened with residential uses. Parking structures should be set back no more than 10 feet. 	18 garages are provided
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Parking reductions may be appropriate for higher density, mixed use projects. Shared parking arrangements may be appropriate. 	Parking is allocated to mixed use development. 138 spaces for Lucas Lofts

		phase I, 401 W Town and 400 W Rich (existing uses).
Site Design and Landscaping		
Building Orientation and Setbacks	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buildings should be located parallel to the street on which they front. The primary façade should be located on the major street abutting the building and the secondary façades should be located adjacent to secondary streets, service drives, and alleys. Buildings on corner lots should be oriented to the corner and to the street fronts, and should make a strong tie to the building lines of each street. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for a principal building is zero feet and the maximum setback for a principal building is ten feet, except where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided. Where a Public-Private Setback Zone is provided, a maximum setback of 15 feet is permitted for up to 50 percent of the building frontage. 	Setback from Rich Street 8'-1"
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The minimum setback for fences and masonry or stone walls is three feet. Fences or walls along a Public-Private Setback Zone may be located zero feet from the sidewalk. 	N/A
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Primary entrances to buildings should be oriented to the primary public street with at least one operable door on the primary public street. Buildings located at a corner should orient the main entrance to the corner instead of to one of the two abutting streets (only one operable door is necessary). 	Consistent
Buffering and Screening	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Between non-residential and residential uses, screening should be a six-foot board-on-board fence or other comparable material; chain link is not acceptable. 	No screening provided. Appropriate for urban nature of the site.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Roof-mounted mechanical units should be screened to their full height should complement the building in terms of color and materials. 	No RTU's
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ground-mounted mechanical units and dumpsters should be located to the rear of buildings and screened to their full height on all sides by screening that is complementary to the building in terms of color and materials, or by evergreen plant material. 	Consistent
Landscaping	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscape materials and design should enhance structures, create and define public and private spaces, and provide shade, aesthetic appeal, and environmental benefits. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Paved areas should be shaded, especially parking lots. 	Addition of street trees on east side of Lucas may be appropriate.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Public, semi-public/private, and private spaces should be demarcated clearly through the use of landscape, walls, fences, gates, pavement treatment, signs, and other methods to denote boundaries and/or buffers. 	Landscape screening may be appropriate to buffer parking lot (headlights) from residential units on ground floor
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Barriers to views or light should be reduced by selecting appropriate tree types, pruning thick hedges, and large overhanging tree canopies. 	Consistent

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping should be used to support storm water management goals for filtration, percolation and erosion control, including rain gardens. 	More information needed
Street Trees and Streetscape	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Street trees are recommended on all public and private streets, with species and spacing approved by the City of Columbus forester. 	Consistent
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Landscaping on private property bordering sidewalks should be designed with new elements, such as a new plant form or material, at a scale and intervals appropriate to the site. This is not intended to discourage a uniform street tree or landscape theme, but to add interest to the streetscape and enhance the pedestrian experience. 	Consistent
Landscape Material	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees (including street trees) should meet the following minimum size at the time of planting: shade trees 2 inches caliper; ornamental trees 1 1/2 inches caliper; and evergreen trees five feet in height. Tree caliper is measured six inches from the ground. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> All trees and landscaping should be well maintained. 	Tree protection detail not finalized. Applicant will conduct design studies considering turning radius, accessibility, and flexibility of space for arts/market.
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Dead items should be replaced within six months or the next planting season, whichever occurs first. The size of the new material should equal the size of the original material when it was installed. 	
Lighting	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting should be appropriate to its location and utilized to enhance security and highlight distinguishing characteristics of buildings. 	To be determined
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lights should have fully shielded, recessed lamps directed downward to prevent glare and shine above the horizontal plane. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Light standards (poles) should not exceed 18 feet in height. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> For aesthetic compatibility, light standards should be of the same or similar type and color. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lighting levels should provide sufficient illumination to ensure security, but without glare, hot spots, or light spillage through residential windows. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Where appropriate, lighting should highlight special architectural or landscape features and/or prominent buildings and gateways. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Wall-mounted lights should be directed downward. 	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Soffit-mounted light fixtures should be recessed in the soffit or otherwise fully shielded from view from any property line. 	

The sixty-nine unit live/work multi-family development is consistent with the general recommendations and the urban design recommendations of the EFCCD plan (p. 4.16). The new development will move forward the plan's vision to add live/work lofts in the Arts and Innovation sub-district and help develop a walkable, dense, mixed-use neighborhood.

Lucas Street has been redesigned to include 70 parking spaces. The design includes the use of various surface materials and street trees to create visual appeal and character for the space. The existing utility poles on Lucas Street will be removed. Headlight screening and additional street trees on Lucas were omitted in order to maximize the sidewalk width, provide maximum flexibility for art displays and maintain the industrial aesthetic of 400 W. Rich.

The 88 new parking spaces will be accessory to Lucas Lofts phase I and existing uses within 401 W. Town and 400 W. Rich, to provide a total of 138 parking spaces for the existing mixed use development. The project also includes 14 bicycle parking spaces associated with phase I. Staff supports the parking reduction as it is a high density, mixed-use project and additional bike parking has been provided to mitigate any negative effects of the parking reduction. Board approval of the site design includes approval of a surface parking lot (accessory use) on a separate parcel than the permitted use. Board determination of south elevation required.

Recommendations:	Conceptual Approval	Approval	Approval with Conditions	Disapproval
Conditions:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Parking located on 201 S. Lucas and Lucas Street will be an accessory use to the existing uses within 201 S. Lucas (Lucas Lofts phase I), 401 W Town and 400 W Rich as stated on the site plan. 2. South elevation as designated by the Board. 3. Removal of alley curb cuts on Town and Rich Street per DPS review. 4. Use of City of Columbus approved surface for the alley. 5. Tree location and protection within Lucas will require further review by Board or Staff. 			

D Applications for CONCEPTUAL REVIEW, CODE ENFORCEMENT AND/OR ZONING

~3:25	15-05-001	Address:	230 W Rich Street
		Property Owner:	Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority
		Applicant:	CASTO
		To be reviewed:	Phase I Development - Conceptual
	Sub-Districts:	West Broad St	Arts and Innovation Dodge Park
	Code Reference:	3323.19 Uses	3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

CASTO is working in partnership with the Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority on a master planned development consisting of approximately 6.4 acres located within the Arts and Innovation sub-district. The site is generally located south of Rich Street and east of McDowell Street. The phase I development consists of approximately 2 acres east of the planned Lucas Street extension and west of the existing warehouse buildings.

Phase I is a vertically integrated mixed-use building fronting on W. Rich Street to the north and the extension of Lucas Street to the west. The L-shaped building contains approximately 20,000SF of commercial or Live-Work space along the ground floor and 124 residential units on 4-floors above a transfer slab to separate the uses. There is a proposed +/- 230-space parking garage intended to serve the private apartment flats and the public. The parking ratio in the private (residential) parking deck will provide approximately 1 space per dwelling unit. Additional public parking opportunities will be available along the newly constructed Lucas Street and Rich Street. The Lucas Street extension will be a public road.

The design theme for the building is intended to emulate a building built over time with two drastically contrasting design themes including a warehouse component consistent with 400 W. Rich Street and contemporary corrugated metal elements designed to emulate re-used metal storage containers. The contemporary and 'warehouse' style are intended to complement one another. The ground floor commercial/ live-work space along Rich and Lucas is intended to be very pedestrian oriented. The commercial space will have non-traditional doorways and varied window treatments, and there is an opportunity for creative signage in front of each tenants store front.

The mixed-use building, including 20,000 SF of live/work or commercial space for multiple tenants and 124 residential units is a permitted use within the Arts and Innovation sub-district. The phase I building is proposed as a five story building with zero feet setbacks. The plan recommends additional setbacks for height between three to five stories; however, the height of the building will not have a negative impact adjacent development and it is staff's opinion setbacks are not necessary. The parking garage will provide 1 space per residential unit and approximately 106 spaces for commercial uses. The parking proposal will require a residential parking reduction of approximately 62 spaces. Staff is supportive of the parking reduction request and the overall phase I proposal.

~3:55 15-05-002 Address: 509 W Chapel
Property Owner: Theodore G. Manfrass, Jr. and Kate M. McCanna
Applicant: Theodore G. Manfrass, Jr. and Kate M. McCanna
To be reviewed: Single-family dwelling unit

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.19 Uses
3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

The applicant is proposing to construct a new, three-story, single-family residence on the parcel at 509 W Chapel Street within the Arts and Innovation sub-district. A single dwelling unit residence and/or a mixed use building are both permitted uses within the sub-district. The parcel is adjacent to Chapel and Mead streets which are both classified as alleys by the City of Columbus. An additional option will be presented that provides commercial space on the ground floor; however additional land is required for the mixed use proposal.

The parcel is located directly adjacent to property owned by the City of Columbus to the west and south and property owned by NWD Franklinton to the north and east. The applicant has communicated with the Columbus Land Redevelopment Office and planning staff and is aware that a large-scale development may occur on the property adjacent to the proposed residence. It is noted that building heights of up to five stories/60 feet with zero foot setbacks for front, side and rear yards are permitted on the adjacent properties. As Chapel Street is an alley, an accessory parking lot may also be a potential use adjacent to 509 W. Chapel.

The applicant is proposing a rear yard at 9% of the total parcel area. This would be a reduction from the 15% required by the EF District. Staff is supportive of this reduction. The applicant may pursue an alley vacation in the future. Staff requests Board comments on the proposed overhead garage door on the north elevation. Staff supports the proposal.

E APPLICATIONS FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROVAL

~4:15 15-05-003 Address: 230 W Rich Street
Property Owner: Columbus Metropolitan Housing Authority
Applicant: CASTO
To be reviewed: Temporary Art Exhibit/Gallery Space

Sub-Districts: West Broad St **Arts and Innovation** Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.19 Uses
3323.21 Development Standards

Staff Observations:

The applicant is proposing a temporary, interactive, art gallery space on the site of Phase II of the CMHA master planned development. The temporary installation will be created using re-used metal storage containers and will be available to Franklinton artists to create and display art work. The purpose of the installation is to promote community engagement regarding the larger development proposed and to create an identity for the future project.

The proposal is for metal storage containers to be placed on site and used for art exhibition space, an outdoor dining space, a temporary gravel parking lot to serve the art exhibition space and up to three food trucks. The installation will be active for five months, from June through October 2015.

Applicable Code Land Use Standard:

Standard	Arts and Innovation	Staff Comments
Art Gallery	Permitted Use	Consistent
Outdoor dining areas	Accessory Use	Consistent
Surface parking, accessory	Accessory Use	Consistent

Recommendations: Conceptual Approval Approval **Approval with Conditions** Disapproval

Conditions:

1. Storage containers removed and temporary parking discontinued five months after date of installation or by December 1, 2015, whichever comes first.

~4:30 15-05-004 Address: 23 S May Avenue
Property Owner: NWD Franklinton, LLC
Applicant: Zachary Graham
To be reviewed: Demolition

Sub-Districts: **West Broad St** Arts and Innovation Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.11 (H) Demolition Permits

Staff Observations:

NWD Franklinton, LLC recently acquired multiple parcels throughout East Franklinton through the purchase of the Byers properties. The applicant is proposing to demolish five structures to hold for future development. 23 S May was constructed in 1950 and was most recently used as a 5200 SF used car sales office by Byers Chevrolet.

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	No replacement use proposed
If no replacement structure or use is proposed, a plan detailing how the property will be maintained has been reviewed and approved by the Board.	Applicant proposes to incorporate building pad into adjacent surface parking lot until future development plans are announced.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Not eligible

Recommendations:

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Disapproval

Conditions:

~4:30

15-05-005

Address:

495 W Broad

Property Owner:

NWD Franklinton, LLC

Applicant:

Zachary Graham

To be reviewed:

Demolition

Sub-Districts:

West Broad St

Arts and Innovation

Dodge Park

Code Reference:

3323.11 (H) Demolition Permits

Staff Observations:

NWD Franklinton, LLC recently acquired multiple parcels throughout East Franklinton through the purchase of the Byers properties. The applicant is proposing to demolish five structures to hold for future development. 495 W Broad was constructed in 1976 and is a single-story, 250 SF office.

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	No replacement use proposed
If no replacement structure or use is proposed, a plan detailing how the property will be maintained has been reviewed and approved by the Board.	Applicant proposes to incorporate building pad into adjacent surface parking lot until future development plans are announced.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Not eligible

Recommendations:

Conceptual Approval

Approval

Approval with
Conditions

Disapproval

Conditions:

~4:30 15-05-006 Address: 44 S Skidmore
 Property Owner: NWD Franklinton, LLC
 Applicant: Zachary Graham
 To be reviewed: Demolition

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.11 (H) Demolition Permits

Staff Observations:

NWD Franklinton, LLC recently acquired multiple parcels throughout East Franklinton through the purchase of the Byers properties. The applicant is proposing to demolish five structures to hold for future development. 44 S Skidmore was constructed in 1962 and is a single-story, 2448 SF shop/warehouse.

Demolition Permit Review:

Standard	Staff Comments
Replacement use reviewed and approved by EFRB	No replacement use proposed
If no replacement structure or use is proposed, a plan detailing how the property will be maintained has been reviewed and approved by the Board.	Applicant proposes to incorporate building pad into adjacent surface parking lot until future development plans are announced.
Is the property eligible for Columbus or National Registers of Historic Places?	Not eligible

Recommendations: Conceptual Approval Approval Approval with Conditions Disapproval

Conditions:

~4:30 15-05-007 Address: **532 and 536 W State – APPLICATION WITHDRAWN**
 Property Owner: NWD Franklinton, LLC
 Applicant: Zachary Graham
 To be reviewed: Demolition

Sub-Districts: West Broad St Arts and Innovation Dodge Park

Code Reference: 3323.11 (H) Demolition Permits

Staff Observations:

F STAFF ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

G BOARD APPROVED APPLICATIONS ISSUED CERTIFICATES OF APPROVAL

647-649 W Broad | Application #15-04-002

1. Wall Sign | Reviewed 04/21/2015 | Issued 04/29/2015

H OTHER BUSINESS

I NEXT MEETING

Tuesday – June 16, 2015 at 50 W Gay St at 3:00 pm.